

AUDIO ENGINEERING SOCIETY

TC-Audio for Cinema Committee Meeting

October 17, 2019
1 pm – 2 pm (EST)
147th New York Convention

Attendees

- Shawn Nageli, Triad / C4
- Paul Tapper, Nugen Audio
- Nuno Fonseca, Sound particles
- Neil Shaw, Menlo Scientific
- Ioan Allen, Dolby Labs
- Scott Norcross, Dolby Labs
- Eelco Grimm, HKU
- Charles Van Winkle, Adobe
- David Murphy, Krix
- Charles Robinson, Dolby Labs
- Ethon Bo?, Student – Shen? University (apologies – cannot read handwriting)
- Arjun Demeyere, PR audio masters
- Dolmar Pedro, Koality Sound
- Kurt Graddy, Arup Acoustics
- Phill Williams, Netflix
- Brian Long, Skywalker (via Audio Conference Bridge)
- Steve LLamb, Deluxe (via Audio Conference Bridge)
- Gunter Oehme (via Audio Conference Bridge)
- Roger Dressler (via Audio Conference Bridge)
- Julian Pinn, Chair (via Audio Conference Bridge)

Agenda

1. Roll Call
2. Minutes
3. Loudness RFP update
 - o The RFP
 - o Responses to date
 - o Discussion
4. Next meeting

Minutes

1. Roll call

- Taken and reflected in Attendees above.

2. Minutes

- Nobody stepped forward to take the minutes and the Chair offered as it was such a short meeting.
- Apologies from the Chair for the lack of minutes from the meeting of the 23rd May 2019. There was some confusion over whether they had been done or not.
- September meeting postponed due to lack of progress since the May meeting and its closeness to this meeting.
- No objections received as to the agenda of this meeting and therefore approved.
- Thanks were expressed to Shawn Nageli and Steve Hutt who helped facilitate the Audio Conference Bridge that enabled the Chair and four others to join the meeting.

3. Loudness RFP update

- The RFP
 - The Chair apologised for the time taken after the last meeting to actually send out the RFP that was ratified and finalised by the committee during that meeting. This was chiefly because the committee agreed during that meeting that there needed to be a covering letter to help orientate the reader and, what with other commitments, this took time to compose.
 - The Chair also apologises for cancelling the September meeting, which he did because of the delay in issuing the RFP and also because it was so close to this very meeting.
 - The Chair also postponed the RFP response deadline to March 1st 2020.
 - The Chair has now issued the RFP as follows during the week starting Sunday September 15th 2019:
 - Presented the RFP at the European Digital Cinema Forum (EDCF) session at IBC in Amsterdam on Sunday, 15th September 2019 in front of about 100 or so industry professionals to good response.
 - Audio Engineering Society – Technical Committee – Audio for Cinema (this committee)
 - Universal (Dave Hodkinson)
 - Disney / Fox (Chris Witham and Mike Radford)
 - Sony Pictures (Brian Vessa)
 - Warner Bros (Mike Zink)
 - Paramount Pictures (Mark Christiansen)
 - National Association of Theatre Owners (NATO) (John Fithian)
 - International Union of Cinemas (UNIC) Technology Group (Guillaume Branders)
 - Trailer Audio Standards Association (TASA) (Ioan Allen)
 - Global Cinema Advertising Association (SAWA) Digital Committee (Cheryl Wannell)
 - Inter-Society Digital Cinema Forum (ISDCF) (Jerry Pierce)
 - European Digital Cinema Forum (EDCF) (David Hancock)
 - Association of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences – Science and Technology Council (Andy Maltz)
 - Cinema Audio Society (Karol Urban)
 - Association and Motion-Picture Sound (AMPS)
 - Commission Supérieure Technique de l’image et du Son (CST) (Michel Monier, Angelo Cosmano, and Hans-Nikolas Locher)

- Society of Motion Picture and Television Engineers (SMPTE) (Bruce Devlin and Thomas Bause Mason)
 - International Organization for Standardization (ISO) (TC36 Secretariat)
 - Published in the December issue of Cinema Technology Magazine (UK)
- Responses to date
 - Disney/Fox: They support this initiative; had issue with quiet movies that work perfectly at reference being lost due to low fader levels being used.
 - Paramount: Happy to discuss further but conscious it's a big topic and that it's mostly due to excessive preshow levels.
 - UNIC: Confirmed they'd like to collaborate - have technology committee of exhibitors representing European cinemas and will meet on the topic before the year-end.
 - SAWA: Confirmed they will discuss in their digital technology committee meeting, which is next meeting in October 2019.
 - EDCF: Confirmed they will support.
 - CAS: Confirmed they will discuss in their board of directors
 - CST: the CST was happy to accept the AES proposal and to participate the RFP response.
 - ISO: TC36 is meeting in October and the Chair (this Chair) will present the RFP to canvas wider international support.
- Discussion
 - Charles Robinson: who's expected to do the work once we get the responses? Chair: it depends on the quantity and nature of the responses and the decision made by this committee once it's evaluated the most applicable next steps.
 - Ioan Allen: this is a political issue and might not be solved by a technical committee. Chair: political issues might have technical solutions and is not convinced that it is purely a political issue but one of workflow fragmentation.
 - Neil Shaw: we need to include the ASA as there is often the threat that regulators introduce law that is not cognisant of the science of audio and that might well limit the quality of the experience (limiters for example). Chair asked if there was any current threat of regulation or if we should let sleeping dogs lie. The feeling was that there is not a current threat outside of what has already happened (Belgium for example). However, there has been this article published recently ([link below](#)) and the committee asked for it to be shared on the condition that people would not forward on or respond to it.
 - Arjun Demeyere: In Puerto Rico we have a lot of cinemas; it's not a technical or political issue but it's subjective according to who is watching the room. The usher is in charge of the volume and isn't trained. 50% of the time, Arjun has to take his earplugs because it's too loud.
 - Gunter Oehme: there are more films being made in non-standard non-theatrical rooms and not to the industry norms for cinema.
 - Ioan Allen: urban living is louder than rural and people tend to tolerate louder playback in cities because of it.
 - Shawn Nageli: LA does seem to be closer to reference fader 7 through fear of film-makers' complaints.
 - Arjun Demeyere: has no data either but agrees with the urban versus rural argument.

- Chair: minor adjustments by the cinema according to their audience and location is fine.
- It was asked if this committee is solely for Loudness. Chair: no, it is also to do with education, setting convention workshops, etc, and other audio-for-cinema topics but Loudness is the current main focus and with this shortness of this meeting, the only topic that we had time to discuss today.

4. Next meeting

- In keeping with the hitherto established four-per-year meeting frequency, it was agreed that the next meeting shall be in 3 months' time, which is before the RFP deadline of March 1st 2020. This will enable the committee to discuss progress of the RFP and any other business.
- It was also agreed that the committee will no longer aim to meet at each AES Convention due to the issues that plague the ability for those who can only join via Audio Conference Bridge, including the Chair, to take part. It was, however, later agreed to compromise and nonetheless aim to meet physically at the NT Convention.
- **EDIT: Since this meeting, the Chair has set the dates of the next three meetings as follows which will all use a Conference Bridge – likely to be Microsoft Teams:**
 - 1500 – 16:30 GMT on Thursday, January 16th, 2020
 - 1500 – 16:30 GMT on Thursday, April 9th, 2020
 - 1500 – 16:30 GMT on Thursday, July 16th, 2020

<https://www.theguardian.com/film/2019/oct/13/cinema-noise-levels-ruining-films-joker-hugh-grant>

Minutes by Julian Pinn